



Reply to "South Asia Instead of Nepal May Be the Origin of the Haitian Cholera Outbreak Strain"

Keim, Paul S.; Aarestrup, Frank M.; Shakya, Geeta; Price, Lance B.; Hendriksen, Rene S.; Engelthaler, David M.; Pearson, Talima

Published in:
mBio

Link to article, DOI:
[10.1128/mBio.00245-11](https://doi.org/10.1128/mBio.00245-11)

Publication date:
2011

Document Version
Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link back to DTU Orbit](#)

Citation (APA):
Keim, P. S., Aarestrup, F. M., Shakya, G., Price, L. B., Hendriksen, R. S., Engelthaler, D. M., & Pearson, T. (2011). Reply to "South Asia Instead of Nepal May Be the Origin of the Haitian Cholera Outbreak Strain". *mBio*, 2(6). <https://doi.org/10.1128/mBio.00245-11>

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Reply to "South Asia Instead of Nepal May Be the Origin of the Haitian Cholera Outbreak Strain"

Paul S. Keim, Frank M. Aarestrup, Geeta Shakya, et al.
2011. Reply to "South Asia Instead of Nepal May Be the Origin of the Haitian Cholera Outbreak Strain" . mBio 2(6): .
doi:10.1128/mBio.00245-11.

Updated information and services can be found at:
<http://mbio.asm.org/content/2/6/e00245-11.full.html>

REFERENCES

This article cites 4 articles, 2 of which can be accessed free at:
<http://mbio.asm.org/content/2/6/e00245-11.full.html#ref-list-1>

CONTENT ALERTS

Receive: RSS Feeds, eTOCs, free email alerts (when new articles cite this article), [more>>](#)

Information about commercial reprint orders: <http://mbio.asm.org/misc/reprints.xhtml>

Information about Print on Demand and other content delivery options:

<http://mbio.asm.org/misc/contentdelivery.xhtml>

To subscribe to another ASM Journal go to: <http://journals.asm.org/subscriptions/>

Reply to “South Asia Instead of Nepal May Be the Origin of the Haitian Cholera Outbreak Strain”

We agree that identification of the origin of the Haitian cholera outbreak is hindered by a lack of data from many parts of the world, including a lack of specific data from *Vibrio cholerae* strains that were circulating in humans and in the environment in Bangladesh and India at the time of and just before the Haitian outbreak (1). Molecular epidemiology is based upon the genomic comparison of the pathogen at the disease foci with possible sources. The “exclusion” of a particular pathogen subtype as the source material can and will be done with great confidence based upon phylogenetic relationships, but the “inclusion” of a possible source will be done with much less confidence, as alternate hypotheses will invariably exist. In this particular study, the Nepal-4 genotype was the most likely source material observed (2), with the other three Nepalese genotypes (clades) excluded due to their more basal phylogenetic relationship to the Haitian isolates. The Nepal-4 inclusion does not preclude other geographic sources, as very similar strains from India and Bangladesh may exist but have not yet been sampled. Indeed, the data in Fig. 2 of the report by Hendriksen et al. (2) demonstrate that the Nepal-4 subtype was present in two locations separated by ~100 km. The Nepal-1 subtype was even more dramatically distributed and present at all sites sampled, spread over a 200-km distance. These *V. cholerae* subtypes therefore appear to be readily dispersed and international boundaries would represent no barrier. Based upon our data, we expect that these subtypes will be found in nearby regions, potentially India and Bangladesh. Additional whole-genome sequence typing or focused single-nucleotide polymorphism genotyping on a broader geographic scale will either lend greater confidence in the Haitian outbreak association with Nepalese strains or, perhaps, lead to alternate hypotheses. Importantly, the interpretation of these genomic results must be done in the context of the Haitian outbreak and the local epidemiological investigation (3).

The fine-scale geographic origin of the outbreak strain is not as important as the conclusion that Haitian cholera was imported into the country, likely from South Asia. This conclusion was very recently supported by a genomic analysis of additional globally distributed strains (4) that clearly shows the impact of the rapid global spread of major human pathogens. In conjunction with the epidemiological link to a United Nations (UN) peacekeeping force (3), it would seem that well-intended aid efforts have gone awry. What actual cholera testing of aid workers occurred is controversial, with contradictory statements from Alain Le Roy, the UN Under-Secretary-General for Peacekeeping Operations, who said, “all soldiers had tested negative for the strain” (5), and General Kishore Rana, the Nepalese Army’s chief medical officer, who said, “none of the troops exhibited symptoms of cholera—so no follow-up tests were done” (6). We would offer that this debate is counterproductive and blaming a particular country for this unintended epidemic serves no honorable purpose. What is clear is that the cholera screening protocols and sanitary infrastructure were inadequate to prevent the Haitian epidemic. A higher standard must be sought and achieved for future disaster relief efforts.

REFERENCES

1. Pun SB. 2011. South Asia instead of Nepal may be the origin of the Haitian cholera outbreak strain. *mBio* 2(5):e00219-11.
2. Hendriksen RS, et al. 2011. Population genetics of *Vibrio cholerae* from Nepal in 2010: evidence on the origin of the Haitian outbreak. *mBio* 2(4):e00157-11.
3. Piarroux R, et al. 2011. Understanding the cholera epidemic, Haiti. *Emerg. Infect. Dis.* 17:1161–1168.
4. Mutreja A, et al. 2011. Evidence for several waves of global transmission in the seventh cholera pandemic. *Nature* 477:462–465.
5. United Nations. 2010. Press conference by Under-Secretary-General for Peacekeeping Operations, December 15, 2010. Department of Public Information, News and Media Division, United Nations, New York, NY. http://www.un.org/News/briefings/docs/2010/101215_Guest.doc.htm.
6. Anonymous. 8 December 2010, posting date. Haiti cholera outbreak: Nepal troops not tested. BBC NEWS South Asia. <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-south-asia-11949181>.

Paul S. Keim

Division of Pathogen Genomics
Translational Genomics Research Institute (TGen)
Flagstaff, Arizona, USA

Frank M. Aarestrup

National Food Institute
Technical University of Denmark
Kongens Lyngby, Denmark

Geeta Shakya

National Public Health Laboratory, Kathmandu, Nepal

Lance B. Price

Division of Pathogen Genomics
Translational Genomics Research Institute (TGen)
Flagstaff, Arizona, USA

Rene S. Hendriksen

National Food Institute
Technical University of Denmark
Kongens Lyngby, Denmark

David M. Engelthaler

Division of Pathogen Genomics
Translational Genomics Research Institute (TGen)
Flagstaff, Arizona, USA

Talima Pearson

Center for Microbial Genetics and Genomics
Northern Arizona University
Flagstaff, Arizona, USA

Published 1 November 2011

Citation Keim PS, et al. 2011. Reply to “South Asia instead of Nepal may be the origin of the Haitian cholera outbreak strain.” *mBio* 2(6):e00245-11. doi:10.1128/mBio.00245-11.

Copyright © 2011 Keim et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-Share Alike 3.0 Unported License, which permits unrestricted noncommercial use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

Address correspondence to Paul S. Keim, Paul.Keim@nau.edu.